

## **POLITICS OF SINDH AND THE FEDERAL CABINET OF PAKISTAN, 1947-1955**

**DR. NAUMANA KIRAN**

Professor, Pakistan Study Centre,  
University of the Punjab, Lahore.  
E-mail: naumana.history@pu.ed.pk

### **Abstract**

This paper examines the role of the federal Cabinet in dealing with the issues related to the Sindh province, from Independence in 1947 to the establishment of One-Unit in 1955. These issues were broadly 1. The designation of Karachi as the federal capital and the recompense demanded by the Government of Sindh; 2 The conduct of Provincial Elections according to joint or separate electorates 3. Refugee settlements in Sindh 4. Unstable Sindh ministries and 5. The issue of Sindh joining the One-Unit of West Pakistan. In all of these we find conflict between the stance of the Federal and the Sindh governments

**Key words:** Capital city. PRODA, Refugee Settlement, One-Unit

### **Introduction**

This paper explores the role of the federal Cabinet to deal with the issues related to the politics of Sindh. It investigates what matters had been addressed by the federal Cabinet and how the institution was successful in settling the issues raised. The study seeks to examine the cabinet's role in dealing with matters related to the making of Karachi as the federal capital, the mode of elections for local bodies, the rehabilitation of refugees, various ministerial crises created due to these issues and finally the conflicts, which developed on the introduction of the One Unit scheme. The paper argues that the Cabinet was successful, after a long debate and with the intervention of Quaid-i-Azam (Great Leader) Mohammad Ali Jinnah, (1876-1948) to bring Sindh politicians to recognize Karachi as a federal area. The financial compensation for this, however government took years to be settled. The Cabinet was also successful in deciding the mode of elections in the province but was only

partly successful in dealing with refugee rehabilitation. It largely failed to successfully address the various ministerial crises, which arose over a number of issues despite debating them at considerable length

The politics of Sindh in early years after independence has been analyzed by many historians and political scientists. Tanvir Ahmad Tahir's *Political Dynamics of Sindh, 1947-1977*<sup>1</sup>, Sarah Ansari's *Life after Partition: Migration, Community and Strife in Sindh, 1947-1961*<sup>2</sup> and M. Yakub Mughal's edited work i.e. *Studies on Sind*<sup>3</sup> are a few examples. These and other studies have evaluated political conflicts, issues related to refugees and centre-province relations but none have evaluated the role of the federal Cabinet in the context of the issues; raised in this study. Secondly, newly declassified Cabinet papers have also not been consulted. This paper relies on primary source material including declassified Cabinet papers and Prime Ministers' Papers. The Cabinet files brings to light aspects related to Sindh politics.

During the years under study, Sindhis felt bitter about the central government the most important reason was the near absence of Sindhis in the federal Cabinet and inadequate representation in the federal legislature. At the time of independence, Sindh's population was around 4.5 million out of a total of 70 million. Sindhis resented receiving fewer seats in the Constituent Assembly of Pakistan (CAP) than they believed they were entitled to and they were upset to receive only one seat in the federal Cabinet. Sindh's demand for parity became a burning issue. This reached a fever pitch when the Cabinet position was also taken away from them<sup>4</sup>. Sindh was not represented in the federal Cabinets of the period under study decisions were taken regarding Sindh federal cabinet without formal representation from the province.

#### **a. Karachi as a Federal Area and Payment of Compensation**

The federal cabinet took up the issue of designating Karachi as a federal area creating the first bout of discord between the Federal government and the government of Sindh. The issue was discussed in the Cabinet meeting on 1<sup>st</sup> January 1948 and it took decision of making Karachi the capital of Pakistan. It formed a Federal Cabinet Committee consisting of the Minister of Finance Malik Ghulam Mohammad, (1895-1956) Minister of Communications, Sardar Abdur Rab Nishtar (1899-1956) and Minister of Interior Affairs, Khawaja Shahabuddin (1898-1977) to work out the details<sup>5</sup>. Ayub Khuhro, (1901-1980) Chief Minister of Sindh (1947-1948) opposed making Karachi the capital. He wrote a letter to Minister of Industries and Commerce, I. I. Chundrigar (1897-

1960) that Sindh government wished to 'retain Karachi under provincial control<sup>6</sup>.' This was perceived as defiance of the federal government. Public feelings were also aroused as processions were taken out in Karachi in protest. The Sindh Provincial Muslim League passed a resolution opposing the plan. Karachi was the most productive part of the province generating revenue of more than one crore rupees. Separation meant a considerable loss to the provincial government<sup>7</sup>. The Sindh Assembly also opposed the Federal government's move<sup>8</sup>. It adopted a unanimous resolution on 10 February 1948:

Karachi must not be handed over to the central government at any cost... Such a step would not only cripple Sind economically and politically but would constitute a flagrant contravention of the Pakistan Resolution, passed by All India Muslim League at Lahore, in 1940, which emphasized the sovereignty and the territorial integrity of the autonomous units constituting Pakistan<sup>9</sup>.

The Sindhi members of the Constituent Assembly of Pakistan also opposed the Cabinet decision. They were of the view that Karachi could be the capital of both the provincial and the national governments<sup>10</sup>?

On the development of fierce opposition to the federal Cabinet's decision Jinnah invited Ayub Khuhro, as Chief Minister to discuss the issue on 25 April 1948. They could not come to an agreement Quaid's effort could not bear fruit and Khuhro was dismissed as Chief Minister on 26 April<sup>11</sup>. Pir Illahi Bukhsh (was appointed as the new Chief Minister but he also could not get Sindhis agree to make Karachi the capital. Ayub Khuhro, even after his dismissal, continued to influence the politics of Sindh through his position as the President of Sindh Provincial Muslim League (SPML). From the platform of the SPML he argued that Sindh's Cabinet was betraying the interests of Sindhis by agreeing to Karachi as the federal capital. Pir Illahi Bukhsh denied and announced that he and his government would never hand over Karachi to the Federal government<sup>12</sup>. Protests against the decision continued.

A delegation of five Sindhi Muslim League leaders met with Jinnah to try to convince him to reverse his decision. He would not do so but assured them that financial compensation would be made to the provincial government. He also told them about the financial difficulties facing Pakistan, Reassured, they returned and passed a resolution in a Sindh Provincial Muslim League party meeting in favour of making Karachi the federal capital. Sindh provincial government was also

permitted to work in Karachi until other arrangements were made<sup>13</sup>. The federal legislature passed a resolution making Karachi the federal city on 24th May 1948<sup>14</sup>. The resolution, moved by Khawaja Shahabuddin, stated that 'the capital of Pakistan shall be located at Karachi<sup>15</sup>.' The resolution was passed despite opposition by many members of the Constituent Assembly of Pakistan from Sindh including Mohammad Hashim Gazdar (1893-1968), Mohammad Ayub Khuhro and Raj Kumar Chakarabarti representing East Pakistan. Mian Iflikharuddin from the Punjab also opposed the resolution.

The capital was thus established in Karachi. The administration of the city commenced on 22 July 1948<sup>16</sup>. The following day On 23 July 1948, Karachi's 812 square miles of territory was ceded to the federal government. The remaining part of the district was renamed as Thatha district, and it functioned as the capital of Sindh<sup>17</sup>. The following day It was only due to Jinnah's intervention that Karachi his birthplace emerged as the capital of Pakistan and Khuhro was unable to prevent it<sup>18</sup>.

There were some concerns among the Sindhi political leadership on payment of compensation. In a meeting of the SPML Council on 20 March 1951, it demanded that the federal government to give 'adequate compensation to the Sindh government in lieu of their taking over of Karachi'<sup>19</sup>. On the issue of payment of compensation, Liaquat Ali Khan, (1895-1951) the Prime Minister while addressed the Constituent Assembly of Pakistan (CAP), saying:

I have been asked as to what will be the position of Pakistan government. The Pakistan government will never be guilty of having done any of the provinces in the eyes, or having had any immoral deal with any of the provincial governments, because I believe that the strength of Pakistan depends on the strength of the provinces<sup>20</sup>.

He was informed that some related matters could only be settled if the federal government paid the promised compensation. The Chief Minister of Sindh Muhammad Yusuf Haroon (1916-2011) had written to the Prime Minister, 'It is more important for us to know first, what we are likely to receive from the Centre as compensation for our assets in Karachi rather than what the Sindh capital is likely to cost us...I would be grateful if you could give an indication of the offer of figure and the installments in which it can be made available<sup>21</sup>.' It was not, however until 1954 that Sindh received its compensation.

A number of ancillary issues relating to making Karachi the federal capital were also settled later by the Cabinet. On 7th April 1954, the Cabinet decided that the Interior Minister should act as the Chairman of a Committee examining the question of the status of Karachi<sup>22</sup>. The terms of reference of the Committee were as follows:

- a. To examine and report what changes if any, should be made in the status of Chief Commissioner's province of Karachi. The committee may keep in view the following considerations.
  - i. The reason which necessitated the separation of Karachi from the province of Sindh and its establishment as the Federal Capital.
  - ii. The constitutional and administrative status of the capital of other important countries with a federal constitution.
  - iii. The position of Karachi as a sole part for all the provinces of West Pakistan.
  - iv. The need to secure economy and efficiency generally.
- b. To indicate the financial implications of the constitutional and administrative changes that may be proposed by the Committee.
- c. To consider any other matter relevant to the issue<sup>23</sup>.

The last line of the draft notification should be read as follows, "It should submit its report to the government as early as practicable<sup>24</sup>.

The Interior Minister informed the Cabinet that Mr. Afzal Hussain, Chairman of the proposed Committee was out of the country and to avoid any delay Akhtar Hussain, Secretary at the of Defense should convene the meetings. The Cabinet decided in favour of the proposal. He was asked to submit his report by 20<sup>th</sup> October 1954<sup>25</sup>.

A Cabinet meeting on the demarcation of the federal capital in the Karachi area was held on 24th August 1955. The Prime Minister informed the Cabinet about a suggestion to demarcate a twenty miles area as the federal capital; He was not, however in favour of demarcation of such a specific area. The Cabinet agreed and decided that it was not necessary to demarcate any specific area as the federal capital, the writ of the Centre should run supreme in the whole of Karachi<sup>26</sup>.

The Federal cabinet was successful in getting the formal approval of Karachi as the capital only due to Jinnah's towering status in the country at the time. It took eight long years to settle the related issues such as compensation to the provincial government and to resolve the issues

related to the administration of Karachi the demarcation of the exact area of the city.

### **b. Provincial Elections**

The second important issue, taken up by the Federal Cabinet concerned the mode of elections for local bodies in Sindh. The Governor of Sindh Din Muhammad to the Prime Minister Khwaja Nazimuddin (1894-1964) requesting him to take a decision regarding the use of separate or joint electorates for non-Muslims. He wrote, 'Personally, I am still of the opinion that in case of local bodies, too, we should adhere to the principle of separate electorates adopted in regard to the elections to the Legislative Assembly<sup>27</sup> without them, he said, non-Muslims would not be able to win even a single seat in many of the areas of the province<sup>28</sup>. In another letter, written on 15 March 1952, he requested the Prime Minister and the Cabinet to make a decision as local bodies elections were scheduled to be held three months later<sup>29</sup>. The Federal Cabinet discussed the issue in its meeting held on 18 March 1952. The Prime Minister read a letter written by the Governor of Sind, and the Cabinet approved the use of separate electorates whether joint or separate electorates in case of elections to local bodies in Sindh. The proposal of Sindh's Governor which favoured separate electorates was approved by the Cabinet finally on 18 March 1952 without much debate<sup>30</sup>. The provincial government was informed four days later:

### **c. Refugee Rehabilitation**

Predominantly a Muslim majority area, Sindh was not given a provincial status during the colonial period but was part of Bombay Presidency. It was only in 1936 that it became a separate province. The economy was dominated by Hindu businessmen, who had started migrating to India even though Sindh observed communal and religious harmony at the time of independence and the incidents of violence against non-Muslims had been minimal<sup>31</sup>. Hindus, nevertheless saw their future in India. Their evacuation to India had mostly been done in an orderly fashion their properties disposed of unlike many areas in the Punjab, in a peaceful fashion before leaving<sup>32</sup>. The exodus of Hindus did however create a number of administrative problems for the government of the province as most of the bureaucratic positions were in hands of Hindus. Business activity was also disrupted.

A refugee problem also developed. Large numbers of Muslim refugees came to Pakistan at the time of the Partition of India. Initially they were welcomed by both the people and the government. During the first few months after August 1947 the majority of the refugees came from eastern India by rail between Jodhpur and Sindh or by ships from west India. However they arrived, most of them settled in Karachi. Many of the new bureaucrats in Pakistan came from north India especially the United Provinces (U.P). Others from the U.P were mostly artisans whereas people from western India were usually traders and businessmen<sup>33</sup>.

A large number of Muslim refugees came to Pakistan at the time of partition of India. Initially, they were welcomed by both the people and government. Majority of the refugees, during the first few early months after August 1947 the majority of the refugees came from eastern India by rail between Jodhpur and Sindh or by ships from western India. However they arrived most of them settled in Karachi. Many of the new bureaucrats in Pakistan background came from north especially United Provinces (U.P) India. Others from the UP were mostly artisans whereas people from Western India were usually traders and businessmen<sup>34</sup>. As a majority of them were educated and specialists in different fields they quickly occupied the spaces vacated by the migration of Hindus. This led to animosity developing between the Sindhis and the migrants (mostly known as Mohajirs) who dominated in these professions, in business and in government<sup>35</sup>. As a result they objected to further migration to the province and this led to confrontation between Sindh and the federal Government. Khuhro made it clear that Sindh could not absorb more than one hundred thousand refugees<sup>36</sup>. The Minister of Refugee Relief and Rehabilitation, Ghazanfar Ali Khan (1895-1963) criticized him for stating that<sup>37</sup>. No provincial government could impose limitations of the number of refugees assigned to a province<sup>38</sup>. Nonetheless a special Cabinet Committee was formed which included Sindh's Chief Minister to examine the issue of refugee resettlement in Sindh. On his part Khuhro raised the question of the constitutional status of the Refugee Council<sup>39</sup> and announced that his government had already designed a policy for refugee rehabilitation<sup>40</sup>. The conflict between the federal and provincial government continued even under Pir Illahi Bakhsh's government when the Governor-General of Pakistan had to promulgate a state of emergency in Sindh on 27 August 1948. Under the emergency powers, the Central Refugee Council directed Sindh government to take up to 200,000 refugees<sup>41</sup>.

The federal government, also had established Joint Pakistan-Sind Refugee Council which consisted of Prime Minister, Governor and Chief Minister of Sindh, the Federal Minister of Refugees and the Provincial Minister of Refugees. Its responsibility was to settle the affairs related to refugee rehabilitation. Its membership was increased on 25 June 1950 without informing the Sindh government. The Federal Minister of Finance, Malik Ghulam Mohammad was added to the Council Kazi Fazlullah, the Chief Minister of Sindh protested to the Prime Minister, 'I respectfully seek your intervention and request that the matter may be brought before the Joint Refugee Council if the Central government considers his inclusion essential to the satisfactory working of this body<sup>42</sup>.' The Prime Minister replied that it was not the intention of the Federal Cabinet to ignore the Sindh government. Ghulam Muhammad was added it was felt that presence of the finance minister was necessary<sup>43</sup> In that way, issue was tried to be settled amicably.

One of the issues that the Federal Cabinet had taken up for discussion was the question of mistreatment of refugees in Sindh Most of one hundred thousand Punjabi refugees were cultivators who had been assured by Sindh's Chief Minister that they would be settled on cultivable land but many complaints about this had reached the federal government. The Ministry for Refugees investigated and while presenting his working paper to the Cabinet it concluded 'it was true that a certain number had been returned dissatisfied but the blame does not lie on the Sindh government alone<sup>44</sup>.' Pir Illahi Bukhsh also wrote to the Prime Minister defending the Sindh Government's mistreatment of refugees.

*Dawn* had reported that 'the Sindh Ministry is also victimizing Muslim refugees in its Secretariat is baseless and calculated to create ill feelings. Hundreds of Muslim refugees have been appointed in the Sindh Secretariat and in the several departments under it<sup>45</sup>.'

Jinnah had previously, advised the refugees to be thankful on what government and the people of Sindh had done on their behalf when Muslim refugees in Karachi had attacked Hindu and Sikh refugees on their way to India:

I quite understand the feelings of Muslim refugees and those who have suffered and they owe my fullest sympathy, but they must restrain themselves and act as responsible men and



not abuse the hospitality that has been extended to them and forget all that is being done for them to make their lot happier<sup>46</sup>.

The issue of mistreatment was to be raised again and again The Federal Minister Khawaja Shahabuddin, called a conference of the editors of all leading newspapers and requested for their cooperation in regard to developing cordial relations between the local Sindhis and the migrant Sindhis. They committed to reducing tension and normalizing the relations of two groups<sup>47</sup>. On the recommendation of the Federal Cabinet, a free fortnightly journal *Nai Zindagi* (New Life) was also established to try to with the purpose to create harmony between two ethnic groups. New inhabitants were informed about the culture of Sindh and how to settle in this area<sup>48</sup>. Governor Din Mohammad, had written to the Prime Minister 'I shall also appeal to the old Sindhis not to treat the neo-Sindhis as alien, as willy-nilly this province is going to be their future home for all times to come<sup>49</sup>.' Ayub Khuhro who had continued his opposition to the settlement of refugees in Sindh reversed course then had started supporting the Prime Minister and federal government's scheme of refugee resettlement in order to protect the rights of Sindhi landlords as the *Hari* movement a campaign to promote the interests of landless peasant farmer was gathering steam in between 1949 and 1950.

In later years, the Cabinet approved a number of the schemes including one related to housing schemes and another concerning the grant of loan to refugees and the like<sup>50</sup>. The Cabinet agreed that the maximum amount of the loan for homeless refugees must be raised from Rs.250 to Rs.500. It further decided that only 25 percent of the 40,000 families of shelter-less refugees in Karachi be advanced this loan; the total amount not exceeding Rs. 50 lakhs<sup>51</sup>.

The federal cabinet remained proactive on taking up and discussing refugee rehabilitation matters. It even used coercive measures to adjust the number of refugees allowed in the province by imposing Governor's rule. On the issue of conflict between Sindhis and the migrants, the federal cabinet adopted a balanced approach and tried to establish a sense of harmony among the two communities. It was, however, unable to satisfactorily settle all the issues raised related to rehabilitation of refugees during the period under study.

#### **d. Ministerial Crisis<sup>52</sup>**

After separating from Bombay Presidency in 1936, Sindh also faced the problem of political instability. Two groups with diametrically

opposite interests dominated the politics of the province landlords and *haris* (peasants)<sup>53</sup>. The same conflict between them (a Hari Committee had been formed in 1930) continued after Pakistan was created in 1947. Ministers were divided over which to support and to what extent and issued statements criticizing both. It created a situation more like 'feudal politics'<sup>54</sup> than parliamentary politics. 'Party loyalties'<sup>55</sup> quickly changed from one group to another. Taking notice of this, Jinnah took and asked the Governor of Sindh Sir Ghulam Husain Hidayatallah (1879-1948) for a report on the situation.

<b>Chief Minister</b>	<b>From</b>	<b>To</b>
Mohammad Ayub Khuhro	15-08-1947	26-04-1948
Pir Illahi Bakhsh	03-05-1948	04-02-1949
Yousuf Haroon	18-02-1949	07-05-1950
Qazi Fazallulah	08-05-1950	24-03-1951
Mohammad Ayub Khuhro	25-03-1951	29-12-1951

**Governor's Rule, 29 December 1951- 22 May 1953**

<b>Chief Minister</b>	<b>From</b>	<b>To</b>
Pirzada Abdus Sattar	22-05-1953	08-11-1954
Mohammad Ayub Khuhro	08-11-1954	13-12-1955

He also spoke to Ayub Khuhro (the Chief Minister of Sindh), he asked Governor to dismiss Ayub Khuhro as Chief Minister. A special tribunal was appointed to investigate the allegations against him. Under Quaid-i-Azam's instructions, Sindh Legislature Muslim League Party elected Pir Illahi Bukhsh as their new leader. His Cabinet took oath on 3rd May 1948<sup>56</sup>. His government faced strong opposition from Khuhro and his followers. Ilahi Bakhsh wrote to Prime Minister Liaquat Ali Khan

In his absence from Pakistan, *Dawn* and *Sind Observer* had started a campaign against his ministry with the support of Khuhro, even accounts of public meetings and letters, by either imaginary persons or open supporters of Mohammad Khuhro and G. M. Syed condemning the government, had been engineered and published in the two newspapers. All this is being done by Mr. Rashdi in consultation with Mr. Khuhro

and G. M. Syed and the *Dawn* had become the medium of propagation of this mischief<sup>57</sup>.

Due to the constant opposition created by the Khuhro group that Illahi Bakhsh only survived in office for ten months and resigning in February 1949. Conflict continued even after his resignation; as different groups vied of their members as Chief Minister and members of the cabinet. Especially, Yusuf Haroon and Pirzada Abdul Qadir were especially active<sup>58</sup>. With Khuhro vehemently opposed to Yusuf Haroon<sup>59</sup>.

During Liaquat's period, Khuhro was penalized under Public and Representative Offices Disqualification Act (PRODA)<sup>60</sup> in 1949, he was later released, but wrangling among different political leaders continued. In most of the cases, Khuhro remained more successful and powerful than others. Some other political leaders avoided him in the government as one of the leaders wrote to Liaquat Ali Khan that the appointment of Khuhro in the Sindh Cabinet just meant the surrender of power to him<sup>61</sup>.

Chief Minister Yusuf Haroon faced a tough time due to both Khuhro and Talpur groups. Khuhro, while using the influence of Provincial Muslim League, brought a No Confidence move against Haroon. He could only secure his seat while letting Khuhro to choose ministers of his cabinet<sup>62</sup>. Talpur complained that Yusuf Haroon had become Chief Minister with the support of his group but after becoming Chief Minister he had joined hands with Khuhro<sup>63</sup>. The clash between Khuhro and Haroon was on the issue of Sind Tenancy Bill also. The Bill aimed at giving security of tenure to *Haris*. Talpur and his supporters opposed a number of points and suggested as many as twenty-two adjustments. Haroon could not resist and accepted the amendments, which changed the original nature of the Bill<sup>64</sup>. Talpur had been facing an awkward situation due to that bill and he requested the Prime Minister to intervene and settle the matter<sup>65</sup>. On 20 March 1950, the situation changed drastically. Ayub Khuhro was absolved of the charges under PRODA by the Chief Justice of Sindh Chiefs Court. On the return of Khuhro to the Legislature, Yusuf Haroon resigned and Khuhro's nominee Qazi Fazlullah formed the ministry<sup>66</sup>.

Khuhro wanted to join the Federal Cabinet, but no one wanted to see him there so he was given seat in the Provincial Muslim League's Working Committee. In March 1951, he was successful in becoming Chief Minister of Sindh once again<sup>67</sup>. An anonymous memo had been received by the Prime Minister's office in which it was requested that Khuhro was very harsh towards his opponents and common people. The jails of Sindh were filled with prisoners under Safety Act when Mr.

Khuhro was Chief Minister of Sindh. He had instructed all the district magistrates to send every man to jail whose name was given by particular *zamindars*, a staunch adherent of Khuhro and oppressor of *haris* (cultivators)<sup>68</sup>.

The developments in Sindh created concerns at the federal level. Therefore, in December 1951, charges of PRODA were imposed on Khuhro for the second time with the Cabinet's approval, but meanwhile he had widened the group of his adherents. One view is that "his domineering personality and personalized rule led him to another entanglement with his Cabinet Ministers, which provided the Centre with an excuse to intervene<sup>69</sup>. Under the Central government's approval, Sindh was put under Section 92-A of the constitution on 29 December 1951<sup>70</sup>. Mr. Din Mohammad was appointed as Governor who run the affairs of the state under Amended Government of India Act 1935<sup>71</sup>. Later, dissensions had been developed between Prime Minister and the Governor on many issues mostly on Din Mohammad's close association with the leadership of Sind *Hari* Committee<sup>72</sup>. Further, the Governor was not ready to follow the instructions of the Prime Minister blindly in nominating his favorites in the upcoming general elections<sup>73</sup>. Din Mohammad had to resign on 12 November 1952.

Governor's rule was over in 1953 after Muslim League was successful in provincial elections and Pirzada Abdul Sattar was appointed as the new Chief Minister at the instance of Governor-General Malik Ghulam Mohammad. He had previously served in the Federal Cabinet. Soon after his appointment Chief Minister of Sindh Pirzada Abdul Sattar imposed charges on federal government in his budget speech. When the Prime Minister called Chief Minister of Sindh, Pirzada told him that he had been forced to make that statement for political reasons but he assured that he would correct it during the course of the next session of the Provincial Assembly<sup>74</sup>.

Ayub Khuhro was successful in overthrowing Abdus Sattar Pirzada and becoming Chief Minister of Sindh again in 1954... On 8th May 1954, it was brought to the notice of the federal Cabinet that ministerial crisis in Sindh was getting worse and that it was between the Chief Minister and the three rebel ministers. The Cabinet decided that the federal government must let the Sindh government settle its own conflicts under the prevailing situation. The Cabinet agreed that the impression that the centre was inclined towards some specific group must be removed<sup>75</sup>. However, federal cabinet's decision did not prevail due to Governor-General's undue interference in the provincial matters and Pirzada Abdus Sattar was dismissed.

The major factor behind removal of Abdus Sattar was his unwillingness to get approval of the One Unit Plan from the Provincial Assembly as they were facing strong opposition from multiple sections of Sindh society including students, lawyers, writers, peasants and others<sup>76</sup>. Khuhro convinced the federal authorities that he was the most suitable candidate to achieve the said task and he proved true to his word and successfully got approval of the One Unit Bill from the provincial Legislature. He suppressed public opinion, arrested many opposition leaders, kidnapped some others, while many were coerced or bribed to achieve the said target. He changed Sindh in a military coup<sup>77</sup>. The Bill was passed on 11 December 1954 in Provincial Assembly's session, which was held in Darbar Hall, Hyderabad for the first time<sup>78</sup> instead of the Provincial Assembly in Karachi. Khuhro's third term as Chief Minister continued till the introduction of One Unit in West Pakistan i.e 13 December 1955.

Overall, Sindh's politics in early 1950s was presented a state of confusion and chaos due to which development work and the refugee rehabilitation process was neglected. The Federal Cabinet's performance remained mixed one on issues related to ministerial crisis in Sindh. Its decisions supported interference of the federal government in the provincial matters as had happened in case of punishing politicians under PRODA, imposing Governor's Rule or dismissing one or the other Chief Minister. However, in some other cases, Federal Cabinet's decisions were not respected by the Governor-General as it had happened in case of Sattar's government, where federal cabinet decided in favour of non-interference, but his government was soon dismissed during the One Unit crisis.

#### **e. Formation of One Unit; Sindh's Response**

As no agreement was reached on any constitutional formula with regard to distribution of seats in the federal legislature between East and West wings of Pakistan, the formula of amalgamation of all administrative units of West Pakistan was discussed in the Cabinet. The Cabinet of All Talents (1954-1955) under Mohammad Ali Bogra worked vigorously for the unification of all provinces and other areas in West Pakistan. Ayub Khan, Defence Minister, formally presented One Unit Scheme in the Cabinet meeting, which was approved after discussion<sup>79</sup>. It was later passed by the provincial assemblies.

Sardar Abdur Rashid's government in NWFP ratified the One Unit Scheme from the Assembly. It was approved by the Punjab Assembly on

November 30, 1954. Abdus Sattar Pirzada, CM of Sindh offered firm resistance and was not ready to get approval of One Unit Scheme from the Provincial Assembly, so he was dismissed on 8 November 1954 and was replaced by Ayub Khuhro only to get the approval of the One Unit Scheme. Pirzada said, on dismissal of his ministry, in a press statement:

The dismissal of my ministry has not come unexpected. My firm stand against the 'one Unit' issue for West Pakistan in the Constituent Assembly and outside has been so uncompromising that today's step was no surprise to me<sup>80</sup>.

The new Chief Minister suppressed public opinion and arrested many opposition leaders and used coercive means to achieve the said target<sup>81</sup>. Hyder Bakhsh Jatoi has written how Khuhro was 'determined to get One Unit imposed through province-wide intimidation, coercion, repression and suppression of public opinion'<sup>82</sup>. He obtained the signatures of seventy four out of one hundred and nine members of the Provincial Assembly on the bill of One-Unit. In this way, One-Unit bill was passed from the Sind's Provincial Assembly also on 11 December 1954<sup>83</sup>. Unfortunately, Khuhro's coercive measures continued even after passing of the One-Unit bill. The Minister for Information and Broadcasting said that Khuhro was victimizing the members of the opposition, and even ex-Ministers were arrested under Safety Acts. The Prime Minister promised that he would personally look into the issue<sup>84</sup>. In another meeting, Prime Minister told the Cabinet that he had personally seen the Chief Minister of Sindh and asked him to take back the cases filed against Talpurs and others insisting no victimization of officers should take place<sup>85</sup>. The Governor-General directed Khuhro that in the election of 2<sup>nd</sup> Constituent Assembly of Pakistan, only those politicians must be elected by the Sindh Assembly who would obey the Head of the State<sup>86</sup>.

The One Unit Scheme was finally approved on December 14, 1954 by the Inter-Provincial Conference attended by the Federal Cabinet Ministers, the Governors, Chief Ministers, the Rulers of the States and their Ministers. Its implementation delayed till the new CAP was elected<sup>87</sup>. Unification of West Pakistan Bill was approved by the Cabinet to present it in the second CAP for final approval on 24 August 1955<sup>88</sup>. West Pakistan was merged into One Unit on September 30, 1955.

## **Conclusion**

The study of the Cabinet Papers and Prime Minister's Paper shows that the federal cabinet had taken up the issues related to Sindh on many occasions. It has been found that the approach of the federal government, in most of the cases, remained imperious. Taking over Karachi as federal area, rehabilitation of refugees in the province after imposition of Governor's rule and passing of One Unit Scheme are the most glaring examples in this regard. In all such cases, the provincial leadership's opinion was either ignored or was manipulated by the Governor-General and other forces. In addition to it, decision on amount and mode of payment of financial compensations in lieu of designating Karachi as federal capital took many years to be decided and materialize. In place of the above policy, it would have been a better option to rehabilitate refugees after giving suitable financial and job security to local Sindhis. However, there were some other subjects such as electorate issue and creating harmony among immigrants and indigenous settlers, on which Sindh government's opinion was valued by the federal cabinet.

Besides it, with or without federal cabinet's approval, various Chief Ministers of the province including Ayub Khuhro, Yusuf Haroon, Qazi Fazlullah and Abdus Sattar etc. were dismissed on the basis of one or the other reason. At the same time, Ayub Khuhro served as Chief Minister for three unfinished terms. It seems that it was at the will of the federal government as well as of federal Cabinet occasionally, either to dismiss Khuhro or to punish him under PRODA but on some other occasions, same Khuhro could be brought in the government to materialize the plans of the federal government as it had happened in case of passing One Unit Scheme. With the unification of West Pakistan, Sindh was also made part of one province against the wishes of majority of the population of this province. Being a parliamentary state, Pakistan's federal cabinet should have adopted conciliatory approach and should have given space to the opinion of the provincial leadership on crucial issues. The best way out was to decide the issues through dialogue in place of implementing them by use of force.

## **Notes and References**

---

<sup>1</sup> Tanvir Ahmad Tahir, *Political Dynamics of Sindh, 1947-1977* (Karachi: Pakistan Study Centre. University of Karachi, 2010)

<sup>2</sup> Sarah Ansari, *Life After Partition: Migration, Community and Strife in Sindh' 1947-1962*. Karachi: Oxford University Press (OUP. 2005)

<sup>3</sup> M. Yakub Mughal ed., *Studies on Sind* (Jamshoro: Pakistan Studies Centre, 1988)

<sup>4</sup> Ansari, *Life After Partition*, 51.

<sup>5</sup> Minutes of the Cabinet Meeting, 1 January 1948, 232/CF/48, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>6</sup> Ayub Khurho to I.I.Chundrigar, 8 January 1948, F.N.7 (2), PMS, NIX. Islamabad.

<sup>7</sup> Tahir, *Political Dynamics of Sindh*, 171.

<sup>8</sup> Zarina Salamat, *Pakistan 1947-1958, An Historical Review* (Islamabad: NIHCR, 1992), 71.

<sup>9</sup> *Dawn*, 11 February 1948.

<sup>10</sup> Tahir, *Political Dynamics of Sindh*. 172.

<sup>11</sup> *Dawn* 26 April 1948. Other factors are mentioned in the funkier pages.

<sup>12</sup> Syed Nur Ahmed, *From Martial Law to Martial Law: Politics in the Punjab: 1919-1958* (New York: Routledge, 1985), 291.

<sup>13</sup> Farooq Ahmad Dar, *Jinnah's Pakistan: Formation and Challenges of a State* (Karachi: OUP, 2014), 196-97.

<sup>14</sup> *Ibid.*, 190

<sup>15</sup> Tahir, *Political Dynamics of Sindh*. 180.

<sup>16</sup> *Dawn*, 23 July 1948.

<sup>17</sup> Qazi S. Ahmed. and Zafar Hassan, 'Evolution of Administrative Boundaries in Sind (1843-1977) in M. Yakub Mughal ed., *Studies on Sind* (Jamshoro: Pakistan Study Centre, 1988), 163.

<sup>18</sup> Allen Mcgrath, *The Destruction of Pakistan's Democracy* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1996) 47.

<sup>19</sup> *Jung*, 21 March 1951.

<sup>20</sup> Liaquat Ali Khan's Address to the CAP. File No. 2(3)-PMS/52. Government of Pakistan. NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>21</sup> CM Yusuf Haroon to PM Liaquat Ali Khan, 26 September 1951. 7(1)-PMS/50, 1950, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>22</sup> The other members included Mr. M. H. Gazdar. Member Constituent Assembly. Mr. Ahmed E H. Jaffer. Member Constituent Assembly, Mr. Mahmood A. Haroon, Mayer of Karachi, CM of Sindh. S.M. Taufiq, president of Karachi ML, Mirza Akhtar Hussain. G. Allana, A Waheed, financial adviser to CM, Karachi and M. Hassan, Secretary to Chief Commissioner to act as Secretary of Committee and not member.

<sup>23</sup> Cabinet Decision, 7 April 1954.72/CF/54-1, NDC, Islamabad. 28 Cabinet Decision, 7 April 1954.72/CF/54-1, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>24</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>25</sup> Cabinet Meeting, 29 September 1954, 72/CF/54-1. NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>26</sup> Cabinet Meeting, 24<sup>th</sup> August 1955, 72/CF/54-1, NDC, Islamabad

<sup>27</sup> Governor of Sindh Din Mohammad to PM Khawaja Nazimuddin, 16 February 1952, FN. 2 (3)-PMS/: GOP. NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>28</sup> *Ibid.*, the Governor had attached a report of the Secretary Local Self Government.



<sup>29</sup> Governor of Sindh Din Mohammad to PM Khawaja Nazimuddin, 15 March 1952, FN. 2 (3)-PMS/52, GOP, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>30</sup> Cabinet Meeting, 18 March 1952, 8/CF/52, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>31</sup> Ali Asghar, Cabinet Secretary to Abdul Ali. Secretary to the Governor of Sind, 22 March 1952. FN. 2 (3)-PMS/52, GOP, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>32</sup> Vazira Fazila-Yaqoobali Zamindar, "1947: Discovering Displaced Histories of Karachi" Michel Boivin and Mathew A Cook, *Interpretating the Sindh World: Essays on Society and History* (Karachi: OUP, 2010), 172.

<sup>33</sup> Summary Presented to the Federal Cabinet, 13 May 1948, 32-R/48, File No. 161-CF- 48, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>34</sup> Ansari, *Life After Partition*, 52-53.

<sup>35</sup> *Ibid*, 189; Lawrence Ziring, *Pakistan in the Twentieth Century: A Political History*, (Karachi: OUP, 1997), 82 and Keith Callard, *Pakistan: A Political Study* (London: Allen and Unwin, 1957), 185.

<sup>36</sup> *Dawn*, 18 January 1948.

<sup>37</sup> *Dawn*. 21 May 1948

<sup>38</sup> Craig Baxter, *From Martial to Martial Law* (Lahore: Vanguard, 1985), 291

<sup>39</sup> United Kingdome High Commission OPDM 10, 29 January-4 February 1948, LWS/1/1599. National Archives, London.

<sup>40</sup> Tahir, *Political Dynamcs of Sindh*, 174-75.

<sup>41</sup> CM Kazi Fazlullah to PM Liaquat All Khan, 26 July 1950, 7(1 )-PMS/50, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>42</sup> PM to CM Sind, 22 August 1950, *Ibid*.

<sup>43</sup> Working Paper: the Ministry for Refugees and the Joint Refugee Council, F.N. 2(2)-PMS/48, Government of Pakistan, Cabinet Secretariat, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>44</sup> Pir Illahi Bukhsh CM of Sindh to PM Pakistan, 30 October 1948, F.N. 7(2)-PMS, Cabinet Secretariat, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>45</sup> *Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah: Speeches and Statements, 1947-1948* (Islamabad: Service Book Club, 1989), 56.

<sup>46</sup> *Nawa-i-Waqt*, 13 July 1949.

<sup>47</sup> Ansari. *Life After Partition*, 89

<sup>48</sup> Governor of Sindh Din Mohammad to PM Khawaja Nazimuddin, 8 January 1952, FN. 2 (3)-PMS/52, GOP, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>49</sup> Cabinet Mtg, 03 January 1951, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>50</sup> Cabinet Decision, 26 August 1953, 7/CF/53, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>51</sup> To understand the nature of ministerial crisis it is compulsory to have knowledge about the time line of CMs of Sindh during the years 1947-1955. , which is given as under.

Chief Minister	From	To
Mohammad Ayub Khuro	15-08-1947	26-04-1948
Pir Illahi Bakhsh	03-05-1948	04-02-1949
Yousaf Haroon	18-02-1949	07-05-1950
Qazi Fazallulah	08-05-1950	24-03-1951
Mohammad Ayub Khuro	25-03-1951	29-12-1951

**Governor's Rule, 29 December 1951- 22 May 1953**

Chief Minister	From	To
Pirzada Abdus Sattar	22-05-1953	08-11-1954
Mohammad Ayub Khuro	08-11-1954	13-12-1955

<sup>52</sup> IAN Talbot, *Provincial Politics and the Pakistan Movement: The Growth of the Muslim League in North West and North East India* (Karachi: OUP, 1988), 39-42.

<sup>53</sup> Asaf Hussain, *Elite Politics in an Ideological State* (Kent: Dawson, 1979), 52.

<sup>54</sup> Mushtaq Ahmed, *Government and Politics in Pakistan* (Karachi: Space Publishers, 1970), 127.

<sup>55</sup> Mir Noor Ahmad, *Marshal Law Se Marshal Law Tuk*, (Lahore: Ablagh Publishers, 1993) 288.

<sup>56</sup> Pir Illahi Bukhsh to PM Liaquat Ali Khan, 8 November 1948, F. N. 7(2)-PMS, Cabinet Secretariat, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>57</sup> Memo No. 1, Un-authored. F.N. 7(2)-PMS/50, 1950, NDC. Islamabad.

<sup>58</sup> Memo No. 12, *Ibid.*

<sup>59</sup> For Details see the Historical Background or Introduction of this work.

<sup>60</sup> It was promulgated by the GG to disqualify politicians from holding offices and thus opposition to his rule.

<sup>61</sup> Letter from Ghulam All Talpur to Liaquat Ali Khan, dated 18 January 1950 File No. 7(I)- PMS/50, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>62</sup> Ayesha Jalal, *The State of Martial Rule: The Origins of Pakistan's Political Economy of Defence* (Karachi: OUP, 1999), 160.

<sup>63</sup> Letter from Ghulam Ali Talpur to Liaquat Ali Khan, dated 18 January 1950 File No. 7(1)- PMS/50, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>64</sup> Tahir, *Political Dynamics of Sindh*, 237.

<sup>65</sup> Ghulam Ali Talpur to Liaquat Ali Khan, dated 18 January 1950 File No. 7(1)-PMS/50, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>66</sup> Nur Ahmad, *From Martial Law to Martial Law*, 377-78.

<sup>67</sup> For detailed study please consult Tahir Alimad, *Political Dynamics of Sindh*.

<sup>68</sup> Un-signed Memo, 'Sind Groaning under Tyranny of Zamindar Raj (Khurho Raj), 7 October 1950, F.N. 7(2)-PMS/50, 1950, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>69</sup> Muntzra Nazir, *Federalism in Pakistan: Early Years* (Lahore: Pakistan Study Centre. 2008), 146.

<sup>70</sup> Jalal, *juil, The Sate of Martial Rule*, 162-62.

<sup>71</sup> F. N. 2(3)-PMS, Cabinet Secretariate, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>72</sup> Jalal, *The State of Martial Rule*, 162.

<sup>73</sup> Tahir, *Political Dynamis of Sindh*, 251.

<sup>74</sup> Prime Minister's Report presented to the Cabinet in its meeting held on 11 March 1954, File N 54/CF/54, CP, NDC. Islamabad.

<sup>75</sup> Cabinet Decision, 8 May 1954, 109/CF/54, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>76</sup> 'Flashback: One Unit: A Dark Chapter in Our History,' *Dawn*, 16 October 2011.

<sup>77</sup> Afzal, *Pakistan: History and Politics*, 144-45.

---

<sup>78</sup> Flashback: One Unit..., *Dawn*, 16 October 2011.

<sup>79</sup> Zarina Salamat. *Pakistan 1947-58: An Historical Review* (Islamabad: NIHCR, 1992), 86.

<sup>80</sup> *Dawn*, 12 December 1954.

<sup>81</sup> Afzal, *Pakistan: History and Politics*, 144-45.

<sup>82</sup> Hayder Bakhsh Jatui, *Injustice to Sindh* (Hyderabad: Hari Publications, 1954), 26-27.

<sup>83</sup> Ahmed Salim, *Pakistan of Jinnah*, 157.

<sup>84</sup> Cabinet Meeting dated 15 December 1954, F. No. 47/CF/55, CP, NDC, Islamabad.

<sup>85</sup> Cabinet Meeting dated 14 April 1955, FN.47/CF/55,CP,NDC.

<sup>86</sup> Jalal, *The State of Martial Rule*, 206.

<sup>87</sup> Baxter, *From Martial Law to Martial Law*, 347.

<sup>88</sup> 24<sup>th</sup> August 1955, 72/CF/54-1, NDC, Islamabad.